

# Minutes of Meeting

## Technical Working Group on Forestry & Environment (TWG-F&E)

FA's Meeting Room

2<sup>nd</sup> June 2006

### 1. Welcome by Chairman

The meeting began with a welcome from the Chairman, H.E. Ty Sokhun and a briefing of the agenda. He introduced Mr. Yos Mony Rath a new TWG-F&E member from MIME and also welcomed the representatives of RECOFTC and BPAMP.

### 2. Adoption of the Minutes of the Last Meeting

The minutes from the last meeting, held on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2006 was adopted. It was stated that information regarding the status of UNDP activities was still outstanding. Mr. Lay Khim offered to give a presentation at next meeting on the UNDP activities within NRM.

### 3. Progress on the Implementation of TWG-F&E Work Plan 2006

Mr. Eang Savet introduced that the TWG-F&E Secretariat has prepared the six-month Progress Report (Dec. 2005 ~ May 2006) for the 7<sup>th</sup> GDCC meeting which will be held on 14<sup>th</sup> June 2006. There are 18 activities in TWG-F&E work plan for 2006. But until now, only 9 activities are implemented on schedule, 6 activities are behind the schedule and the rest 3 activities are partly on and behind the schedule. The constraints of the implementation of TWG-F&E work plan is caused by the insufficient funding, lack of donor back-up and attention for TWG meetings, and the alignment of additional financial support through the TWG-F&E mechanism. TWG-F&E is unable, with the present donors to mobilize the resources required for year 2006.

In conclusion, H.E Ty Sokhun shared information regarding the strengthening and enforcement of the forestry law especially the combating of forest land clearing and encroachment. Recently, the government has issued the order to all municipal/provincial governors to take back the forest land which has been illegally grabbed by the offenders. As results, 23 provinces have taken back the land mounting to 141,000 ha among the total cleared/encroached land of 250,000 ha. He also optimistically expressed that the remaining land will continued to be confiscated during next month.

On another note H.E. Ty Sokhun informed that the SGS has supported the Forest Crime Monitoring and Reporting unit of FA in service of tracking system. But until now there has been no donor indication forthcoming for financing SGS. He took that occasion to request funds from the donor representatives in the meeting in supporting the SGS's role in monitoring the forestry sector.

### 4. Discussion of input to the GDCC Meeting on 14 June 2006

In association with the progress report of TWG-F&E to the 7<sup>th</sup> GDCC meeting which will be held on 14 June 2006. Mr. Christensen raised the point that the collaboration between the relevant government ministries is a crucial element for real progress. His point of view for the 7<sup>th</sup> GDCC meeting is to urge more collaboration between MLMUPC and FA in land demarcation as there still no significant demarcation of the state forest land is taking place. He encouraged MIME, MoD and FA to work closely together for concession issues. A lot of issues of that kind in the forestry sector needs attention.

In feedback to the comments of Ms. Noelle O'Brien of RECOFTC and Mr. Arvid Sloth, Danida, H.E. Ty Sokhun clarified regarding the Prakas on Forestry Community will be expected to finish within next week among various offices in MAFF. Regarding the forest and land, the RGC has set up the National Authority for Land Conflict Resolution with members coming from the relevant ministries and consist of minister, secretary/undersecretary of state and director general level and other representatives. H.E. Ty Sokhun and his colleague, Mr. Chea Sam Ang are also the members of the General Secretariat of this authority. H.E Ty Sokhun indicated that the authority has formulated its structures from the central to the local level. It has sub-committees at municipal/provincial level that chaired by the Governors of each province with representatives of relevant provincial departments including military and police. For the district level, the authority has set up the task force lead by district governor. So, all the competent

authorities are involved in the process and the officials of Forestry Administration play a role as secretaries. We found this mechanism has been successful and the RGC gives the deadline to all governors to issue the decision to confiscate the illegal occupied land by 31 May 2006. With this confiscation, the RGC allows one month period for any relevant group or individual to complain. The confiscated land will be kept as state property or converted to social land concession. However, during the implementation of confiscation of illegal land, there have been troubles with demonstrations.

At the end of discussion, H.E. Ty Sokhun wished to provide the issues for consideration during the 7<sup>th</sup> GDCC meeting. In addition, Mr. Arvid Sloth drew attention to that the Military has still not disclosed specific information regarding potential forest land designated as “military development zones”.

#### **5. Presentation on DANIDA Support to Forestry Sector and TWG-F&E**

As the Cambodia Tree Seed Project (CTSP) will be terminated at the end of June 2006, Mr. So Thea, Project Manager presented the outputs and outcomes which have been achieved by the project during the period from 2001-2006. The main objectives and activities have been to develop the capacity of the tree seed and forest gene conservation sectors in Cambodia focusing on supporting the endangered situation of the indigenous tree species and their future potential.

Mr. Arvid Sloth informed that an additional arrangement has been developed to support the forest sector in specific selected priority areas. Remaining funds from two terminating projects: “Cambodia Tree Seed Project” and the “Kbal Chhay Watershed Project” has, thanks to decision taken at the high level consultation RGC and Denmark January 2006, been reallocated to priority areas through detailed proposals. These proposals build on the project’s base objectives which involve improved livelihood in Kbal Chhay area, Forest Governance/National Forest Programme, Forest Gene Conservation, Running and development of the TWG secretariat and finally a lump sum not yet specified. Part of these activities will be implemented with the assistance of the Centre for Forest and Landscape and Planning. Furthermore all proposals depend on that the TWG-F&E Secretariat will and can provide logistic support such as computer, transport and administrative services to these implementations. All proposed activities are in addition to the support the projects objectives directly helping towards filling the gap in funding of activities listed at the TWG Work Plan. Hope was also expressed that this would allow the TWG secretariat to play stronger facilitating role.

At the end of presentation, H.E Ty Sokhun congratulated Mr. So Thea and Mr. Arvid Sloth for being successful in the implementation the Cambodia Tree Seed Project as well as expressed his sincere appreciation to DANIDA for this latest pragmatic effort in helping sector development.

#### **6. Presentation on Final Strategic Paper of National Community Forestry Programme**

Dr. Sokh Heng, Acting Chief of CFO/FA reminded that last year he already presented about the formulation of National Community Forestry Programme (NCFP) and now it has been finalized (Ref. NCFP Strategic Paper). The presentation described about the process of formulating of the programme/documents and the objectives of this programme are:

- To identify and agree on medium and long term community forest management objectives at the national and local level.
- To formulate a sequence of implementation plans to maximize Cambodia’s potential for establishing formally recognized CF (ref. presentation at the TWG-F&E homepage).

#### **7. Presentation on the Status of BPAMP**

Dr. Klaus Schmitt, Senior Advisor of Biodiversity and Protected Areas Management Project (BPAMP) of the Ministry of Environment presented the meeting on the status and achievement of BPAMP. The aim of BPAMP is to achieve sustainable management of its system of protected areas. The project has been implementing by MoE starting from 2003 and will finish at the end of 2006. The budget for this project is USD 4.9 million which is shared by WB as a loan, GEF as a grant and RGC as a counterpart fund. For the location of the key project site, Mr. Klaus raised the Virachey National Park which is located in the Dragon Tail area of Ratanakiri province. It is one area among 23 protected areas established by the royal decree in 1993.

The project has two objectives:

- To develop and test proactive measures to minimize unsustainable exploitation and degradation of the biodiversity of national and global significance in Vrachey National Park.
- To use the experiences gained from Virachey National Park to help formulate institutional models for the development of the National Protected Area System of Cambodia.

H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed that this project should not be implemented under loan. It should be implemented under the grant aid.

#### **8. RECOFTC Presentation on JSDF Project**

Ms. Noelle O'Brien, Programme Manager for Capacity Building Services of Regional Community Forestry Training Centre (RECOFTC) for Asia and the Pacific explained that RECOFTC is a non-profit international organization established in 1987 and based at Kasetsart University in Bangkok, Thailand. This centre is supported by 7 regional governments and the main supporters are Swedish, SIDA and Swiss SDC. The aim of RECOFTC is to enhance capacity of all levels and to promote constructive multi-stakeholder dialogues to ensure equitable and sustainable management of forest and natural resources.

For Cambodia, RECOFTC has various activities with partners and the JSDF that is administered by the World Bank (WB) and planned implementation by RECOFTC. The grant value for this project is just below 2 mill USD. Originally it was planned for implementation by Community Forestry, International. Primary objective of the JSDF capacity building effort is to help forest dependent villagers, the Forestry Administration, NGO partners, and local governments to explore innovative approaches to collaborative forms of forest stewardship and participatory monitoring. This project will have specific field sites in Kampot, Kratie, Ratanakiri, Pursat, Kampong Thom and Siem Reap. (Ref. presentation at the TWG-F&E homepage).

#### **9. Presentation on the Status of Mining Concession Zones in Cambodia by MIME**

Mr. Yos Mony Rath, Director of Mineral Resources Department of the Ministry of Industry, Mine and Energy (MIME) briefed that Cambodia has classified the significant mineral occurrences in 5 groups as follows:

- Metallic Mineral
- Non-metallic Mineral/Industrial Mineral
- Gemstones
- Solid Fuel Mineral
- Construction Material

Regarding the mining concession areas, Mr. Mony Rath continued that so far MIME has issued about 40 licenses to private companies to conduct the exploration and mining in Preah Vihear, Stung Treng, Mondulakiri, Ratanakiri, Battambang and Kampot province. Most of companies are involved in metallic mineral, coal, limestone for cement and gemstone. Recently, MIME has found gold deposits in Keo Seima district, Mondulakiri province (Phnom Prich Conservation Area).

Mining concessions are different from the forestry/economic land concessions. A mining concession is just issuing the licenses to the large areas for conducting the exploration. The methods of exploration are varied. Some companies use satellite image to interpret the mineral concentrates. After that they relinquish the areas to the government and take only a small area to conduct the mining. He continued that right now there are a lot of conflicts between mining and Economic Land Concessions. For instant, recently, MIME has issued the exploration license for bauxite in Mondulakiri as this area is rich of reserved bauxite. But the lands at the bauxite area are also very fertile and therefore attractive for fast growing exotic tree plantations. MAFF has also issued the license to Wuzhishan LS Group to grow pine trees in the same area.

For comments, Mr. Mogens L. Christen urged the relevant ministries to have a discussion in the next TWG-F&E meeting on how the environment, forestry and mining could be addressed such as EIA and SIA. He also recommended relevant parties to exchange data on this issue.

## **10. Presentation on Fast-Wood Plantations, Economic Concessions and Local Livelihoods in Cambodia by NGO Forum**

This presentation was presented by Dr. Katrine Seidel, A NGO Forum Advisor. She raised 3 case studies among 5 provinces (Koh Kong, Kampong Speu, Pursat, Prey Veng and Svay Rieng) concerning planting of fast-growing trees. Most of the tree species in the plantations are exotics like eucalyptus, acacia and pines.

Key findings from selected case studies of Pheapimex Co., Ltd, Wuzhishan SL Group and from Communities in Prey Veng and Svay Rieng indicate that the socio-economic and environmental impact of concession on local livelihood and communities are often negative.

Their research based on these case studies recommends that the companies and relevant authorities to consider regarding ordinary management and governance elements, like for example EIA, SIA, public access to information, verification and demarcation of concession boundaries, provision of employment to the local villagers, accountability of the company and the compliance of legal standards that refer to land law 2001, law on environmental protection and other relevant laws and sub-decrees. (ref. presentation at the TWG-F&E homepage)

Mr. Eang Savet suggested Ms. Katrine to consider not only on EIA and SIA but also on the Economic Impact, as it in his understanding not a fair comparison was illustrated in the presentation.

## **11. OAB**

### **11.1 Map of Economic Land Concessions**

Regarding the disclosure of information, H.E. Ty Sokhun showed the map of economic land concessions 2005 which outlined the concession areas. He added that there is only data of UTM in the FA homepage but for the map is not yet available as it will consume more spaces in the server. We have requested the people and MAFF to upload the Economic Land Concession Map into their homepage. However, FA can provide this map to any interested party upon the request.

### **11.2 Social Land Concessions**

H.E. Ty Sokhun informed that the Social Land Concessions can be implemented as soon as all lands that encroached by offenders are confiscated. He took that occasion to express the sincere appreciation to Japanese Ambassador who has expressed interest in this issue while he joined a field trip with the FA to Ratanakiri, Stung Treng, Kratie and Oral of Kampong Speu province.

### **11.3 Appreciation to DANIDA Support**

He also expressed the appreciation to DANIDA for reallocating remaining project funds to support the TWG-F&E Work Plan and its Secretariat. But what we need is more support than from DANIDA.

### **11.4 Forest Land Demarcations**

Beside the above-mentioned issues, H.E. Ty Sokhun remarked that the demarcation of forest land is important. The forest demarcation would bring down or even stop the deforestation process. We expect that by June this year the MEF will allocate the funds for the implementation. This process is also considered as parallel with the legal action of confiscation of the illegal land encroachment.

However, FA has some partners that have already practiced forest demarcation in Koh Kong. We have closely cooperated with local authorities, communities and people to solve the problem regarding the land demarcation.

We have learnt that MoE is now also in the process of land demarcation in some protected areas.

## 12. Close of the Meeting

H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed his sincere appreciation to all members and presenters for their participation, contributions and efforts in the meeting and looks forward to continued contributions and participation in the next forum.

### Participants

1. H.E. Ty Sokhun TWG-F&E Chairman
2. Dr. Mogens L. Christensen Lead Donor Coordinator
3. Mr. Chea Sam Ang Deputy Director, FA
4. Mr. So Thea Vice Chief of FWSRI, FA
5. Mr. Seng Sun Narun Deputy Chief of PAO, FA
6. Dr. Sokh Heng Acting Chief of CFO, FA
7. Ms. Thai Seilatina Accountant, CTSP
8. Mr. Sy Ramony Chief Office, DNCP, MoE
9. Dr. Klaus Schmitt Sr. Project Advisor, BPAMP
10. Mr. Hem Van Yuth Deputy Dept. Director, CDC
11. Ms. Suon Pinkanika Deputy Officer, MEF
12. Mr. Yos Mony Rath Director, Mineral Res., MIME
13. Mr. Phok Salor Chief Officer, MIME
14. Mr. Sin Sokhon Deputy Director, MLMUPC
15. Mr. Lay Khim Team Leader/ARR, UNDP
16. Ms. Kazumi ITO Program Assistant, JICA
17. Mr. Daniel Costa First Secretary, EC
18. Mr. Thai Hang Meng Executive Secretary, CTIA
19. Dr. Bob Tennent Project Manager, SGS
20. Ms. Katrine Seidel Advisor, NGO Forum
21. Mr. Reed Aeschliman Director of OGD, USAID
22. Mr. Cullen Hughes Economic Growth and Environment Officer, USAID
23. Ms. Noelle O'Brien Capacity Building Programme Manager, RECOFTC

### Secretariat

1. Mr. Eang Savet Director, STLFAI, FA  
Tel: 012 915 372  
Email: [savet2003@yahoo.com](mailto:savet2003@yahoo.com)
2. MoE Representative. Yet to be nominated
3. Mr. Arvid Sloth DANIDA Advisor  
Tel: 012 969 301  
Email: [arvid@online.com.kh](mailto:arvid@online.com.kh)  
arvidsloth@hotmail.com
4. Mr. Yuzuru Kimura JICA Advisor  
Tel: 012 700 115  
Email: [kimura@online.com.kh](mailto:kimura@online.com.kh)
5. Mr. Sok Srun Secretary of TWG-F&E  
Tel: 012 940 936  
E-mail: [twg.fe@citylink.com.kh](mailto:twg.fe@citylink.com.kh)

The minutes of meeting was adopted by the TWG-F&E Meeting on 26 September 2006.

Recorded by

---

Sok Srun  
*Secretary*  
*TWG-F&E Secretariat*

Endorsed by

---

Mogens L. Christensen  
*TWG-F&E Coordinator*

---

Ty Sokhun  
*TWG-F&E Chairman*