

Minutes of Meeting

Technical Working Group on Forestry & Environment (TWG-F&E)

At the Forestry Administration's Meeting Room

8th December 2006

1. Welcome by Chairman

The meeting began with a welcome from the Chairman, H.E. Ty Sokhun, and a briefing of the agenda. He introduced Mr. Chay Sakun, representative from MAFF and other representatives from concerned institutions, who are members of the Technical Secretariat Economic Land Concessions (ELC) attending the meeting in order to share information on economic land concession.

2. Adoption of the Minutes of the Last Meeting and following up since last meeting

Mr. Mogens Christensen expressed his wish to follow up on the minutes from the last meeting, especially the information sharing from the BPAMP project. He asked the MoE representative what is the progress of releasing data to the public domain. Mr. Sy Ramony, the MoE representative said that he reported to the Senior Minister, and the BPAMP project sent hard copies to the TWG-F&E Secretariat. He forwarded email of Mr. Mogens and the Secretariat to the BPAMP. BPAMP has uploaded the data to the project website. BPAMP also plans to organize a launch of project database on 21-22 Dec 06, and TWG-F&E members will be invited to join.

Mr. Mogens suggested to change the date of the launch due to that time is Christmas days that most donors will not be able to participate. The mentioned data in the project website is last two years ago, that is not data requested. We have been asking for the gap formality data, GIS data, raw data, for two year. He will write to the top management level of WB who is funding to the project. He asked MoE representative to report back about the concerns of the TWG-F&E and especially of the donors.

Mr. Peter Jipp is very much to support the effort to get the data release. He would like a conversation before the end of next week when we have meeting with the minister on a number of topics including forestry, biodiversity in Cambodia and just get a clarification.

The minutes of the last meeting, held on 26 September 2006 was adopted (it is available in www.twgfe.org).

3. Progress report on the Implementation of TWG-F&E Work Plan 2006

Mr. Sok Srun gave a briefing on the 12 months Progress Report (Jan-Nov 2006): presented the structure of the TWG-F&E Secretariat. In TWG-F&E work plan for 2006, there are 18 main activities: 7 activities are implemented as on estimated schedule, 5 activities are partly on and partly behind the schedule, and the rest 6 activities are behind schedule. Information sharing includes organisation of meetings, attendance meeting, presentations from government institutions, development partners, and receiving and distributing publications, programs and reports. (Report is available in www.twgfe.org). He pointed out that TWG Secretariat organised 2 signing ceremonies with the Danida on the support to TWG-F&E work plan and the support to the natural resource management and livelihood program.

Referring to the information sharing, Dr. Andrew suggested that if the Secretariat could post more information into the website including the overview of supported fund to activities of last year TWG work plan, and recent MOU agreements on the support with the timeframe. Then the development partners could make commitment to funding some activities in the next year work plan.

Mr. Mogens suggest that on the next report to GDCC meeting in January 2007, we should use the words “on schedule”, “nearly on schedule”, and “behind schedule”.

Regarding to “practical implementation of forest demarcation and demarcation of protected areas” H.E Ty Sokhun informed that this activity has been funded by MEF, 660,000,000 Riels (ca. US \$ 165.000), and end of this year progress report will be available. Referring to forest cover assessment has been completed 70% or 80% and next week the experts from GRAS A/S, Denmark will come to start the work of quality of the assessment.

4. Presentation on a draft of a Four Year TWG-F&E Action Plan, 2007-2010.

The drafted four year Action Plan and assessment of the TWG-F&E Secretariat for strengthening of its functions were presented by Mr. Arvid Sloth. The objectives of the Action Plan are to set joint priorities by the government agencies and their development partners to the course towards sector development, - to align funds to meet these priorities and thus be a step towards meeting the mission of the TWG,- as envisioned by the Royal Government of Cambodia (presentation is available in www.twgfe.org). The four-year draft Action Plan is built on inputs from four sources:

- A. Review of overall governmental strategic plans with relevance to natural resource management
- B. Interview with stakeholders and TWG members
- C. Continuation of core and uncompleted elements from the work plan 2005
- D. Priorities endorsed by the TWG F&E.

The objective of the TWG-F&E Four Year Work Plan is to formulate a set of priorities agreed by the government agencies and their immediate development partners to the course to sector development and fulfilment of national priorities and policy objectives.

The Four Year Action Plan is built on a structure of four pillars, which are:

1. The forestry resources of the country are considered as the Permanent Forest Estate and managed by promoting sustainable natural resource management (Forestry Governance)
2. Conservation and sustainable management of the national forest resources and forestation of arable land to substitute demands from natural forests (Conservation and Reforestation)
3. Rural livelihoods supported through a maximum participation of local populations and involvement of private sector in natural resource management (Community Based and Small-Medium Forest Enterprises)
4. A wide range of multi stakeholder processes implemented to enable harmonization of perceptions, interests and capacity of forestry stakeholders (Capacity Development)

Mr. Arvid highlighted the role and the potential of the Four Year TWG F&E Action Plan as a basis and framework for agreement on joint development priorities among the the Royal Government Cambodia and its immediate development partners within the natural resource management. The development, the support and implementation of such a longer-term TWG plan is right into the Cambodian strategic framework for development cooperation, including the TWG/GDCC mechanisms for sector wide coordination, which all are direct in line with the OECD/DAC principles of good practises for development cooperation.

Concerning to the coming annual action plans, Mr. Mogens suggest that activities could be adjusted and flexible, especially at the activity level, to match the right issues at right time, depending on the requirements and dialogue development.

Regarding to the prioritization of activities in the work plan, Mr. Peter Jipp, WB, suggested that a number of activities could be spread out a little bit more toward the back of four-year period. It would be an assumption that we are going to gain over time some greater support from the funding agencies that are interested in forestry and may be some new funding agencies will come forward over that period.

Mr. Mogens would like to discuss with JICA on the support of certain activities, and H.E Ty Sokhun is happy to join in the discussion. Could we do something agree on the 2007 work plan? Our intention for the next year plan should be at least 80% listed in the plan should be accomplished.

H.E Ty Sokhun would like to keep on the discussion of long-term work plan rather than moving to annual work plan 2007, as the annual plan is just a slice of the four year plan. The activities must be reflected to our available fund and how to implement the work plan.

Mr. Peter Jipp: some activities will require inter-ministerial coordination over the four-year period.

The TWG does not meet regularly enough and therefore the establishment of a TWG Task Force to assist in core activities like the development of a National Forest Programme was decided. The technicians who are attached with the task force, donors and governmental side, must have the

necessary technical capability to provide a qualified debate. The task force must report to the chairman of what is going on. The task force could meet 4-5 times a year.

Mr. Nhean Tola, JICA representative indicated that prioritization is good but sometimes it does not work. Limited information sharing between ministries is also very much a concern, sometimes it is a very good idea,. This platform for this is very important; he would like to share with WB about the progress of poverty reduction strategy next year after the approval. Poverty reduction and cross-ministerial information sharing are big components of natural resource management. In this case, if we could make information sharing which is very helpful.

H.E Ty Sokhun: the Four Year Action Plan is a basic framework for us, when we develop annual plans then we can focus on the priority issues. There are 35 activities listed in the matrix are not all can be first priority but they are complementing each other which is an important point. Some activities are key priority issues inside these; they may be the critical keys to the success of forestry reform. Regarding to the information sharing by setting up relevant inter-ministerial or cross-sector approach, it would be an agenda of the TWG. The implementation has to set specific responsibilities for one agency or entity to take over the job. Anyway, the holistic approach of cross-sector cooperation is important. Referring to little knowledge of TWG, the intention of those organisations is to make noise. H.E informed that MoE has designated one representative to joint the Secretariat. Technical task force is an option but it should be set up for specific activities on ad-hoc basic. Activities could be flexible to change but objectives/outputs could not be changed.

Regarding to the establishment of task force Dr. Andrew emphasized it is a flexible mechanism to help to TWG on specific activities, like the NFP assistance, that could attract the donors interest.

Referring to prioritization of activities, Mr. Mogens called for all donors to support activities over the four-year period.

Due to limited time for more discussion, the work plan was endorsed in principle, but leave within one week for the later comments from the members could be sent to the secretariat and pass to the consultants for consideration.

Mr. Mogens suggested having discussion on the progress report of the action plan last year before the GDCC meeting in February 2007.

5. Update on progress regarding Economic Land Concessions, and performance of the ELC Technical Secretariat and Assistance Team

Mr. Chay Sakhun, representative from MAFF presented Economic Land Concession. This agenda is followed up the recommendation by the last GDCC meeting, 5 Oct 2006. Economic Land Concession (ELC) Technical Secretariat Component has been established since June 2006 and consists of 7 relevant agencies: MAFF, MoI, MEF, MoE, MoC, MLMUC and Council for lawyers. Inside the MAFF set up ELC technical secretariat assistant that has one chief and nine members from line department. Up to 30 Nov 2006, 60 companies with total land of 987,769 ha have been signed contract, and 28 companies with total land of 221,030 ha had been cancelled. (presentation is available in www.twgfe.org).

Regarding to overlapping economic land concession in the provincial of Kampongthom and Kratie that rose in the last GDCC meeting by the Japanese Ambassador. In the Government-Private sector forum Samdech Hun Sen decided that economic land concession, which is less than 1,000 ha, provincial investment subcommittee has authorisation to give to investment company with adequate consideration and shall get approval from MAFF in advance. It is not only in Kampong Thom and Kratie have overlapping issues but also in Kampong Speu province. It is seem miscommunication in granting land concession between central government and provincial government, unclear map and boundaries of forest and protected areas. Now government allow the representatives from Forestry Administration and Fisheries Administration to joint in the provincial subcommittee. He expected that in future the granting land would not overlap any more.

Mr. Daniel Costa, EC, had two questions: How the distribution of contract? What are the benefits and amount of taxes gain from this concession?

Mr. Chay Sakun: Referring to sub-decree No.146, separate two types of project, project contracted by government, project from private company. In Cambodia does not impose tax on land but has land fee.

Dr. Andrew asked: Does allocation of economic land concession follow the provision of the Land Law? (only private state land can be granted to ELC) Which land had been forested in the past? Do you have information about the amount of capital which has been invested in the ELCs? What is the status of land after cancellation of the contract? Are the cancelled ELCs still forested or not?

Mr. Chay Sakun said that MAFF have established social land committee to work together with MLMUPC to focus on the cancelled ELC, we are sharing information, and allocating some land to social land concession when require as land near commune, near river... The provision in the Land Law is limited only 10,000 ha can be granted to ELC. However, some lands have been granted before the Land Law are more than that. Technical Secretariat ELC is working on that with concession companies and may be cancel some of these ELC. Regarding to some ELC are forested land, the reason that we granted because the RGC has policy to develop national economy.

Due to limited time H.E Ty Sokhun interrupted, this issue is the hot one which was raised by H.E Ambassador of Japan in the GDCC Meeting, and Senior Minister Keat Chhon, Chairman of GDCC instructed to TWG-F&E to deal with this issue, otherwise it will be brought to the next GDCC meeting. He thought that it still has more questions from the floor, and can be wrote to the TWG-F&E Secretariat and forward to the Technical Secretariat of ELC to answer in writing. If the answers are still not satisfied, we will invite you come to present and answer again before it will be brought to the GDCC meeting again.

6. Update on progress regarding Military Development Zones

Mr. Kong Dam, represented General Chea Sam Oeun, on behalf of Ministry of National Defence, apologized that he could not report the information on military development zones due to some of the military regions and divisions have not sent the reports to the MoD and under process. In principle he promised to present in the next meeting.

6. Close of the Meeting

H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed his sincere appreciation to all members of TWG-F&E for their participation and contributions in the meeting and special thanks to the presenters with the best and success and looks forward to continued contributions and participation in the next forum.

Participants

- | | |
|------------------------------|--|
| 1. H.E. Ty Sokhun | TWG-F&E Chairman |
| 2. Mr. Mogens L. Christensen | Lead Donor Coordinator, Danida |
| 3. Dr. Andrew Wardell | Counsellor-Development, Danida |
| 4. Mr. Peter Jipp | Senior Natural Resource Management Advisor, WB |
| 5. Mr. Masahiko HORI | Chief Adviser, CBFS II Project, JICA |
| 6. Mr. NHEAN Tola | Program Assistant, JICA |
| 7. Mr. Peter Jipp | Senior NRM Specialist, WB |
| 8. Mr. Daniel Costa | EC Delegation, 1 st Secretary |
| 9. Mr. Joe Walston | Director, WCS |
| 10. Mr. Tom Evans | TA, WCS |
| 11. Mr. Arvid Sloth | FLD Special Consultant |
| 12. Mr. Chay Sakun | Deputy Director, MAFF |
| 13. Mr. Hem Van Yuth | Deputy Director, CDC/CRDB |
| 14. Mr. Sam Sidara | Vice Office, MIME |
| 15. Mr. Kong Dam | MoD Representative |
| 16. Mr. Sy Ramony | Chief Office, DNCP, MoE |
| 17. Mr. Chea Sam Ang | Deputy Director, FA |
| 18. Mr. Seng Sunarun | FA |

TWG-F&E Secretariat

- | | | | |
|-----------------------|----------------------|------------------|--|
| 19. Mr. Yuzuru Kimura | JICA Advisor | Tel: 012 700 115 | Email: kimura@online.com.kh |
| 20. Mr. Sok Srun | Secretary of TWG-F&E | Tel: 012 940 936 | E-mail: twg.fe@citylink.com.kh |

The minutes of meeting was adopted by the 12th Meeting of TWG-F&E on 23rd February 2007

Recorded by

Sok Srun
Secretary
TWG-F&E Secretariat

Endorsed by

Mogens L. Christensen
TWG-F&E Coordinator

Ty Sokhun
TWG-F&E Chairman