

Minutes of Meeting

Technical Working Group on Forestry & Environment (TWG-F&E)

At the Forestry Administration's Meeting Room

26th September 2006

1. Welcome by Chairman

The meeting began with a welcome from the Chairman, H.E. Ty Sokhun, and a briefing of the agenda. He introduced H.E. General Chea Sam Oeun, a new TWG-F&E member from Ministry of National Defence, in order to share information on military development zones inside forest and protected areas. Today we also have the honour that H.E. Sek SETHA, Deputy General Secretary of Council of Land Policy and Head Office of Legal Unit, MLMUPC attending the meeting to present the progress of land management and state land classification. The Chairman also apologized for the postponement of the meeting.

2. Adoption of the Minutes of the Last Meeting and following up since last meeting

Dr. Mogens Christensen would like to follow up on the minutes from the last meeting, especially the status of strategic paper of community forestry programme. H.E. Ty Sokhun clarified that the Prakas on Forestry Community was adopted and signed by the Minister of MAFF, including guidelines for the community forestry planning and a model of an agreement and it is in the process of circulation. We are also in the process of legalization existing community forestry as mainly from former FAO project in Siem Reap Province. Additionally a community forestry project agreement was signed between RGC and the WB Country Director, and Executive Director of RECOFTC with honour presence of Japanese Ambassador.

Concerning the data releasing of BPAMP project, Dr. Mogens Christensen asked the MoE representative when these data will be released to the public domain as the project is going to closed at the end of this year. Mr. Sy Ramony, the MoE representative said that he has no information from BPAMP. Dr. Mogens asked Mr. Sy Ramony to follow up with his Ministry about this matter and report back to the TWG-F&E to ensure that potential important data of protected areas can be shared with the TWG-F&E. This issue has been raised several times, and if no satisfactory progress is made, will be brought up at the next GDCC meeting.

H.E. Ty Sokhun emphasized importance of data sharing among the stakeholders and asked Mr. Sy Ramony, as the MoE representative, to quickly report to Senior Minister of MoE with this request.

The minutes from the last meeting, held on 2nd June 2006 was adopted. (Minutes of meeting is available in www.twgfe.org).

3. Progress on the Implementation of TWG-F&E Work Plan 2006

Mr. Eang Savet gave a briefing on the nine-month Progress Report (Jan-Sep 2006) for the 8th GDCC meeting which will be held on 5th Oct 2006. There are 18 main activities in TWG-F&E work plan for 2006. During the first nine months of year 2006, 7 activities are implemented as on estimated schedule, 6 activities are behind schedule and the rest 5 activities are partly on and partly behind the schedule. One of the activities behind schedule is the "*practical implementation of forest demarcation and demarcation of protected areas*". Although MEF has allocated budget for this activity which will begin in October, it needs more budget support. The proposal "*Definition of management options for sustainable forest management in Cambodia*" will start in 2007 if support is allocated.

The constraints of the implementation of TWG-F&E work plan is caused by insufficient funds to cover the TWG work plan, information sharing from all stakeholders to TWG secretariat needs attention and improvement, and more donor support and back up for TWG meetings. TWG-F&E is unable, with the present donors to mobilize the resources required for development. (Report is available in www.twgfe.org). The total budget for the AWP-2006 amounted to 18.49m US \$; of this US\$ 5.33 of funding was secured representing 29% of the total budget.

Dr. Mogens Christensen reiterated earlier identified needs for long term work plan and suggested that the secretariat took the first steps to prepare a long work plan for 3-5 years with more details making

windows for other donors to start considering contributing. During the next meeting we might discuss a long term programme which can be implemented from 2007.

H.E Ty Sokhun noted that inputs from the donors' sides are Danida, Jica, and that the World Bank starts to involve in community forestry. He appreciated and agreed with the comments made by the lead donor coordinator regarding the long term work plan. We would like to concentrate on the highest priorities and not too comprehensive. He requested the TWG for no objection to that the funds received for consultancy assistance could be used for recruiting a consultant to support the preparation of the work plan. The drafted work plan should be ready for discussion in the next meeting in first or second week of December before the Christmas holidays. Mr. Arvid Sloth was suggested to fulfil this work since he has most experience with the secretariat work and policy planning, if he has available time. We would like to take opportunity of the new facility, multi-donor fund by Danida-Dfid that support NRML programme, so we have to prepare our work plan to accommodate the programme. And we also have capacity building from the phase II training project funded by JICA.

4. Presentation on community-based forest gene conservation

Mr. So Thea presented a modality on community based forest gene conservation. The objective of the proposal is to manage and use forest genetic resources through collaborative partnerships with communities and communes (Presentation is available in www.twgfe.org).

H.E Ty Sokhun emphasized that these activities were planned as the base on TWG-F&E work plan 2006, and that is also continues from the Cambodia Tree Seed Project. There are some remaining funds and Danida agreed to transfer this fund for supporting these activities. The proposal is designed as an integrated element of the FA and it was stressed that it is not a project structure.

Mr. Lay Khim had two impressions, firstly whether this project can be mainstreamed into the existing or any new initiatives related to community forestry and which then may the factor that can scale up conservation activities. Secondly, a general comment was raised regarding the importance of both conservation and incentive to communities and how these two elements can go together.

It was explained community based forest gene conservation is part of community forestry and provide an additional dimension to benefit gaining for communities while important native trees were conserved. There could be multiplier factor out of this initiative. Economic incentive should not be overlooked. Community forestry alone seems not to be financially sustainable in Cambodia for the time being and this is an issue.

Referring to RGC Action plan for donors' action plan harmonization and alignment Mr. Mogens emphasized that one of the RGC key indicators over the next few years is to eliminate project implementation units (PIU), and the TWG will be become the central focus point for donors and RGC's cooperation. This forum is already the formal coordinating body in which we can share information and take responsibility for the joint work plan; - this is the clear objectives of TWG and of RGC.

Mr. Lay Khim highlighted the complications of having two ministries each with considerable NRM mandates in the same TWG and was concerned about the great challenge for the TWG in this regard.

Again the representative from MoE was requested to send a senior official to attach with the TWG-F&E secretariat as a start of handling this challenge. H.E Ty Sokhun informed again to MoE representative to report to his minister to send one senior official to join with the secretariat. We are going to prepare a new work plan then we would like to have the MoE's representative to actively participate.

5. Presentation on information of Military Development Zones

General Chea Sam Oeun, on behalf of Ministry of National Defence, apologized that he could not report the information on military development zones due to the Ministry had not clear information of military land locations. As the military regions reported unclear information including cleared land for cropping with forested land. This information was considered as unofficial. Therefore, Deputy Prime Minister and Minister of MoD reordered, in September, to all military regions to report all information including state properties, building and land which are belong to the Ministry. He needs a clarification what kind of land he has to report, the cleared land, cropping land, or the forested land.

Dr. Mogens Christensen welcomed the representative from MoD that we have been waiting for long time. The information requested is just regarding forest land, including its location and its size, occupied by the ministry.

General Chea Sam Oeun will disclose some information on military development zones in the next meeting.

6. Presentation on Progress on Land Management and State Land Classification

H.E Sek SETHA, Deputy General Secretary of Council of Land Policy, MLMUPC briefed that Cambodia classified state land as following:

- Public state land: property having a natural origin: forests, natural lakes, seashores...
- Private state land: neither state public land, nor legally privately or collectively owned under the land law of 2001 etc. (Presentation is available in www.twgfe.org).

Dr. Andrew Wardell asked about the royal decree on the establishment of national authority on resolution of land conflict which was adopted early this year, and could you add a few words about status of that initiative. H.E Sek SETHA: the royal decree it was not belong to us to draft it. He related only the law, regulations and policies, which were prepared by the ministry. However the senior minister is also the first vice president of the authority.

H.E Ty Sokhun added that the national authority is chaired by the Deputy Prime Minister H.E. Sok An chairs as a representative of the prime minister, senior ministers and ministers from relevant ministries and agencies as members. The authority has worked closely with relevant institutions, collecting all complaints about land conflicts from everywhere up to now 2,700 cases have been recorded in a tracking system and classified and prioritized to solve the conflicts. Some extension works are being broadcasted to people to be aware of preventing forest land clearings and land certificates. The authority has meeting every month and weekly meeting at the secretariat. Mr. Chea Sam Ang, Deputy Head of FA regularly attends the meetings. An order, number one, was issued to order all provincial governors, as chairmen of sub-committees for combating forest land clearing and encroachment, to confiscate the illegal occupied land. Nearly 200,000 ha of the forest land have been confiscated. Secondly, an order is focused on controlling and use of chainsaw due to the rapid illegal clearing of forest land.

Ms. Anna Beloff concerned with the social land concessions and that ownership of land is basically needed for the communities to manage the land for economic development. How is it considered?

H.E Sek SETHA: the social land concession is in step of piloting to distribute land to poor people who are landless. There are three steps in this process of giving land to the poor people. Firstly, we should have land available that is private state land, secondly commune council identifies the landless people, and thirdly, infrastructure in this concession area needs to be developed. The pilot areas are in province of Kampong Cham and Kratie, and if they are successful, we will extend to others. He clarified that the national authority is an extra judicial mechanism, created in 2005, to solve the problem of land disputes, and the land law 2001 created a cadastral commission. Both institutions are working closely together.

H.E Ty Sokhun concerned with the economic land concession, according to the sub-decree only private state land can be granted as economic land concession. According to the law forest land is public state property but it has been allocated to economic concession and that is not consistent with the provision of the law. Our concern is that they may cut down big forest and plant small non forest trees like cashew nut, sugar cane, cassava etc. Now we stop logging but a high deforestation rate. If the land is used for plantation or for forestry purpose, it has to follow the forest law under article 61.

The lead Donor Coordinator advised that MAFF and MLMUPC should work together for having clear identification of types of the land and produce transparent maps for what is already and what is planned for concessions.

7. Presentation on Cardamom Wildlife Sanctuaries Management Project

Mr. Lay Khim informed that H.E Kol Vathana has been abroad so that this presentation could not be presented, and he apologized for that.

8. Presentation on Small Grant Programme

This presentation was presented by Mr. Chhum Sovanny, National Coordinator. The objective of the two Small Grant Programmes is to work directly in providing grants and technical support to NGOs and Community Based Organization.

- The GEF SGP is funding activities related to environmental protection and livelihood develops adaptation to climate change and land degradation. Project funded ranges from 25,000-70,000USD. The major activities including community based natural resource management, small business for income generation and integrate agricultural production, promote social capital, demonstrated and piloted innovative technologies and reforestation.
- The SGP PTF funded activities related to the forest dependant poor, in particular livelihood and capacity building initiatives which promote the sustainable use of forest resources. Project funded ranges from 10,000-50,000USD. The main projects' interventions are transformation fro bio-gas into energy, organic farming in protected area, women empowerment in community fishery management, sea grass protection and mangrove reforestation etc. (presentation is available in www.twgfe.org)

Dr. Sokh Heng noticed that mostly of grants are being given to NGO rather than CBO and asked whether there were any barrier for the CBO to access the grants?

Mr. Chhum Sovanny said that actually we would like to provide the grants to CBO, but at this moment the CBO has problem with capacity, structure management, proposal development etc.

H.E Ty Sokhun expected that UNDP has no discrimination between NGOs and governmental or research institutions can also to access to these programmes. He requested the progress report funded by small grant programme concerning the information of seedling production and tree planting. We recognized the support from NGOs, private companies.

Mr. Chhum Sovanny said that besides small grants programme UNDP sometimes has medium fund or big funds programme which are applicable for the governmental agencies. He hopes that the allocation to CBOs and academic institutions will be in 2008. Concerning the progress report, the programme is updating its progress every quarter and distributes to related agencies.

9. Presentation on Support to the National Forest Programme

Mr. Arvid Sloth, representing Forest and Landscape, Denmark (FLD), briefed about the cooperation between FA and FLD and the background on the support to good forest governance, in relation to the development of the National Forest Programme. (Presentation is available in www.twgfe.org).

Dr. Mogens Christensen suggested that the national forest programme should be linked with the long term work plan of the TWG-F&E that is going to prepare and discuss in December.

Ms. Anna Beloff informed that the FAO would also like to support development of NFP and FA has been encouraged to fill a concept note for submitting at the end of this month and that funds of 300,000\$ may be available.

H.E Ty Sokhun: FA has been invited for submitting concept note for the last 3 years but nothing happens. FAO seem does not like to implement the NFP activities but may concentrate reports and collecting information from member countries for their files and documentation.

Anna Beloff: as soon as the NFP facility funding, a steering committee will be created, the funds are also to be used by stakeholders like NGOs, CBOs, and small projects under the steering committee.

Dr. Mogens Christensen: Any support that has no the TWG approval should be reconsidered. TWG F+E is the coordination body for these sectors.

H.E Ty Sokhun concluded that these issues will be clarified in the next meeting when we have the draft long term work plan.

10. Close of the Meeting

H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed his sincere appreciation to all members of TWG-F&E for their participation and contributions in the meeting and special thanks to the presenters with the best and success and looks forward to continued contributions and participation in the next forum.

Participants

1. H.E. Ty Sokhun TWG-F&E Chairman
2. Dr. Mogens L. Christensen Lead Donor Coordinator, Danida
3. Dr. Andrew Wardell Counsellor-Development, Danida
4. Mr. Peter Jipp Senior Natural Resource Management Advisor, WB
5. Mr. Lay Khim Team Leader/ARR, UNDP
6. Ms. Anna Beloff NRM Officer, FAO
7. Mr. Kim Chhay Ly Democracy/Governance Management Specialist, USAID
8. Mr. Chheng Kimsun Deputy Director, FA
9. Mr. Chea Sam Ang Deputy Director, FA
10. Mr. Sy Ramony Chief Office, DNCP, MoE
11. Mr. Suon Pinkanika Deputy Office, MEF
12. Mr. Hem Van Yuth Deputy Dept. Director, CDC
13. H.E Sek Setha Deputy General Secretary of Council of Land Policy, MLMUPC
14. Mr. Huy Phap Director of Land Administration Department, MLMUPC
15. Mr. Phan Sin Legal Advisor to CLP, MLMUPC
16. Mr. So Thea Vice Chief of FWSRI, FA
17. General Chea Sam Oeun Ministry of National Defence
18. Mr. Sim Sopheap Ministry of National Defence
19. Mr. Arvid Sloth Senior Consultant, Forest, Landscape and Planning, KVL, Denmark
20. Mr. Chhum Sovanny National Coordinator, UNDP
21. Dr. Sokh Heng Chief of CFO, FA
22. Mr. Jean Marc Bouvard Adviser, MAFF/AFD

TWG-F&E Secretariat

- | | | | |
|------------------------|----------------------|------------------|--|
| 23. Mr. Eang Savet | Director, STLFAI, FA | Tel: 012 915 372 | Email: savet2003@yahoo.com |
| 24. MoE Representative | Yet to be nominated | | |
| 25. Mr. Yuzuru Kimura | JICA Advisor | Tel: 012 700 115 | Email: kimura@online.com.kh |
| 26. Mr. Sok Srun | Secretary of TWG-F&E | Tel: 012 940 936 | E-mail: twg.fe@citylink.com.kh |
| 27. Ms. Thai Seilatina | Accountant | Tel. 012 627 475 | E-mail: twg.fe@citylink.com.kh |

The minutes of meeting was adopted by the TWG-F&E Meeting on 8 December 2006

Recorded by

Sok Srun
Secretary
TWG-F&E Secretariat

Endorsed by

Mogens L. Christensen
TWG-F&E Coordinator

Ty Sokhun
TWG-F&E Chairman