

Minutes of Meeting

Technical Working Group on Forestry & Environment (TWG-F&E)

The Forestry Administration

FA's Meeting Room

29 August 2005

1. Welcome by Chairman

The meeting began with a welcome from the Chairman, H.E. Ty Sokhun. After briefing on the agenda, the Chairman had proposed the meeting to comment.

2. Adoption of the Minutes of Meeting

The minutes from the last meeting held on 10 May 2005 were adopted with a slightly change of item #5 at the last paragraph which stated that "*The RGC expressed disappointment with these two initiatives*" being changed to "*The TWG-F&E expressed disappointment with these two initiatives*".

3. Introduction of TWG-F&E Secretariat

As the Secretariat just has been established, the Chairman introduced the two (2) new persons of the Secretariat, Mr. Yuzuru Kimura, JICA Advisor to the Secretariat, and Mr. Men Marina is a new recruited Secretary to the TWG-F&E. The Secretary and secretariat will assist the whole tasks of TWG-F&E to implement the goals as stipulated in TOR.

The Chairman had suggested MoE to assign one official to join the secretariat members of TWG-F&E.

Mr. Eang Savet raised the issue of lack of support from donors to the work plan. He also requested to the working group to provide the information related to the forestry and environment supports.

Mr. Mogens L. Christensen noted that since the discussion began there is no solution to move the plan forward, including funding the plan. Therefore, he suggested to find the time for next TWG-F&E meeting in a months time and have a first roundtable discussion with selected resource persons and TWG-F&E members to discuss and make long-term planning and monitoring and if possible with support form private sectors and NGOs. The secretariat was requested to prepare such a first long-term planning meeting.

4. Presentation of the ITTO Diagnostic Evaluation Mission

To share information on the results of the International Tropical Timber Organization (ITTO) Diagnostic Evaluation Mission which undertaken between 16 – 30 October 2004, Mr. Arvid Sloth, DANIDA Advisor to FA had presented about missions analyses, findings, prioritized obstacles / challenges to achieving Sustainable Forest Management (SFM).

The challenges and constraints that were identified are:

- No long-term National Forest Programme (NFP) and no support for the process.
- Management system must be compatible with SFM.
- The capacity in forest sector, in government agencies and in private sector and other civil society are too low for SFM.
- Donor and Government coordination is weak. TWG is an important facility. The TWG's Action Plan is a positive first step for a National Forest Programme.
- Lack of incentives for SFM, both at industrial forestry and community forestry.

- Development and testing of Partnership forestry and decentralized management system.

Comparing to year 2000 objective, ITTO has found some progressive which has been made in:

- Policies and legislative reform
- Establishment of PFE
- Consultation with local communities
- Expanding forest lands for conservation
- Reorganization of administrative arrangements

In respect of the core issues of forestry in Cambodia, Mr. Arvid had indicated the total forest contribution (direct and indirect) to national GDP was estimated by the mission to about 10% which gives the sector to a significant role in development and poverty alleviation.

Moreover forest development goals must be ensuring through contributions to growth, poverty alleviation, good forest governance, local needs for products and environmental services, and global environmental values, biodiversity, carbon storage etc.

While the presentation had disclosed the findings on the uncertain sector policies, it expressed the recommendation as follows:

- Community forestry is important but will not solve problems of extensive forest landscapes.
- Avoid excessive regulation of marginal issues which focus on regulating things that are important and realistic.
- Do not over-regulate in forestry sector.
- Recognize the large indirect contribution of forest to the GDP, including subsistence and other non-market values, estimated to 10% highlighting the forestry sector's prime role in rural livelihood.

Other recommendations included focus on incentives to retain competent staff, attitude and organizational performance in addition to technical training, social and environmental disciplines, FA's operational budget should be made in adequate, work in partnership with specialists from outside and resident advisors for successful implementation, commune council has no tradition or competence of forest management.

Private investment in plantation can contribute to the forest sector development objectives. High quality hardwood plantations must be considered. Plantation may vary in scale from household woodlots to industrial pulpwood estates. Land allocation for industrial plantations should be restricted to areas designated for conversion, not on biodiversity rich areas. Small and medium plantation enterprises have potential to contribute to sustainable and equitable economic growth and poverty alleviation.

5. a) Quarterly Progress Report of TWG-F&E for the period from June to August 2005

In order to monitor and follow up the constraints or outstanding matters, the GDCC (Government-Donors Coordination Committee) requires the TWG-F&E to complete the Quarterly Progress Report of June – August 2005 and return to them by 31 August 2005. It was briefing by the Secretariat with the proposed to comment by Chairman on each item of the minutes.

Mr. Eang Savet, Secretariat of TWG-F&E referred to the speech of Prime Minister **Hun Sen** on 10 September 2004 in the occasion of Government-Donor Pre-CG Meeting had said that the Partnership

working group has concentrated its work on harmonization of aid utilization, with the aim to increase the effectiveness of development assistance. In this regard, he has noted that there is no support from the donors since the TWG-F&E was established on 19 November 2004.

According to the local news (Kampuchea Thmey Daily) dated on 26th August 2005 wrote that the EC has been supported seven environment and forestry projects about €5.6 million to Cambodia. But until now, we have not got it yet, especially in forestry sector. He also requested to the TWG-F&E members and donors, kindly support to forestry and environment in accordance with the work plan of TWG-F&E.

Sharing the same matter, Mr. Mogens L. Christensen, TWG-F&E Coordinator suggested that TWG-F&E should submit its quarterly progress report to the CG and list that any project activities related to forestry and environment sector should be consulted with the TWG-F&E before approval.

Concerning the development management plans for protected areas, Mr. Sy Ramony, MoE reported that only 2 or 3 management plans among the total 23 protected area management plans have been progressed. In this case, UNDP noted that 2 management plans have been done that one of which is funded by UNDP through FFI. At the end of this session, the Chairman had concluded that some management plans of the protected areas have been done with some others in progress.

After the comments and suggestions, the report was finalised and adopted with an approval from TWG-F&E.

b) Report on TWG-F&E input for NSDP

Mr. Yuzuru Kimura, JICA Advisor explained on the background and events after last time meeting of NSDP (National Strategic Development Plans). He noted that based on the results of Consultation Workshop on NSDP 2006 – 2010 held on 27 – 28 June 2005 at the Intercontinental Hotel, the development goals and constraints were summarized in the results matrix. Following that results, the Ministry of Planning requested for our comments on the results matrix in a short deadline and due to this circumstances, Mr. Mogens L. Christensen, TWG-F&E Coordinator suggested (on 09 August 2005) that the completed matrix of the forestry sector should be comment and drafted by the Secretariat with technical support from a small working group, and it should be submitted to the Ministry of Planning by 16 August 2005.

In relation to the above explanation, Mr. Lay Khim from UNDP inquired if the Secretariat accepts further more comments for amending the TWG-F&E matrix. In response to this question, Mr. Mogens L. Christensen answered that it could be added more comments on NSDP formation.

To conclude this, the Chairman informed that NSDP is still opening for more comments and he asked the Secretariat to take note this point.

6. FA's Suggestion for a Model for the Annual Bidding Coupes

The presentation was presented by Mr. Chheng Kim Sun, Deputy Director of FA that focused on the coupe bidding procedures.

Before going to the bidding procedures, he introduced the members to pay attention to the management of production forest outside the forest concession and protection forest. He referred to the Prakas #316 dated 18 July 2005 issued by MAFF on Legal Procedures for Acquiring Annual Forest Product by Product Right within Production Forest outside Concession Areas based on Public Bidding Coups. The product harvest from these bidding coups will mainly supply to domestic use or export, stated in Article 20 of Forestry Law.

7. Presentation on Cambodia Poverty Assessment by WB

Mr. Chris Jackson, Economist from WB presented his research on Cambodia Poverty Assessment focusing on Emerging Conclusions on Forestry and Environment. He also introduced about poverty rates, agro-climatic zones, composition of incomes and agricultural incomes, deforestation, and fragile soils.

Need preliminary analysis from CSES to further evidence of declining access to, and productivity of, common property resources. Fishing fall in incomes (lower yield, not loss of access) and forestry fall in incomes (loss of access and lower yield). Further work on Poverty-Environment Nexus will provide further evidence.

In conclusion, the Chairman did not fully agree with one point of WB presentation which is stated that *“Forestry fall in incomes due to loss of access and lower yield”*. It does not reflect the real situation of the forestry sector. He suggested that the researchers should give more attention to the most updated data in order to provide more accurate information.

Mr. Chris Jackson took note of comments and suggestion from the Chairman on this matter.

8. Presentation of list of forestry and environment projects known by TWG-F&E

In relation to item #8 of the agenda, the representative from FAO, Mr. Sao Sopheap had suggested TWG-F&E Secretariat to send the list of forestry and environment projects (mailing list) to all members and relevant operational projects and ask them to feedback in order to keep abreast of up to date information. By doing this way, TWG-F&E Secretariat will act as a focal point which help to share the updated information among members.

Agenda points 8-10 (Projects within Forestry and Environment; Salary supplements, Report on Capacity needs assessment, New JICA project), were postponed to the next meeting.

9. Closing of the Meeting

On behalf of TWG-F&E, H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed his thanks to all members for their contributions to the important subjects discussed this afternoon.

Participants

1. H.E. Ty Sokhun	TWG-F&E Chairman
2. Mr. Mogens L. Christensen	Coordinator
3. Mr. Chea Sam Ang	Deputy Director, FA
4. Mr. Chheng Kim Sun	Deputy Director, FA
5. Mr. Than Sarath	Chief, PAO/FA
6. Mr. Seng Sun Narun	Deputy Chief, AIO/FA
7. Mr. Sokh Heng	Acting Chief, CFO/FA
8. Mr. Kith Bunna	Deputy, FMO/FA
9. Mr. Moy Ratha	Reforestation Office, FA
10. Mr. Sy Ramony	Chief of NPWS, MoE
11. Mr. Chum Viseth	MLMUPC
12. Mr. Ho Sivyong	MoC
13. Mr. Takeichi Jiro	JICA Project F. Advisor
14. Mr. Goseki Kazuhiro	JICA Expert
15. Mr. Joe Waltson	WCS
16. Mr. Chris Jackson	Economist, WB
17. Mr. Chan Sophal	Poverty Specialist, WB
18. Ms. Chamroeun Mudita	Operations Officer, WB
19. Ms. Anna Beloff	NRM Officer, FAO

Secretariat

1. Mr. Eang Savet	Director, STLFAI
Tel: 012-915 372 Email: savet2003@yahoo.com	
2. MoE Representative. Yet to be nominated	
3. Mr. Yuzuru Kimura	JICA Advisor
Tel: 012-700 115 Email: kimura@online.com.kh	
4. Mr. Arvid Sloth	FA/Danida Advisor
Tel: 012-969 301 Email: arvid@online.com.kh	
5. Mr. Men Marina	Secretary TWG-F&E Secretariat
Tel: 012-991 999 E-mail: twg.fe@citylink.com.kh	

- | | |
|------------------------|--|
| 20. Mr. Sao Sopheap | Assistant FAOR (Prog) |
| 21. Mr. Lay Khim | UNDP |
| 22. Mr. Paul Mason | USAID |
| 23. Mr. Thai Hang Meng | CTIA |
| 24. Mr. Guo Ge | GM Assist, Everbright
Forest Concession |

The minutes of meeting was adopted by the TWG-F&E Meeting on 26th October 2005.

Recorded by

Men Marina
Secretary
TWG-F&E Secretariat

Seen and Approved by

Mogens L. Christensen
TWG-F&E Coordinator

Ty Sokhun
TWG-F&E Chairman