

Minutes of Meeting

Technical Working Group on Forestry & Environment (TWG-F&E)

FA's Meeting Room
28th February 2006

1. Welcome by Chairman

The meeting began with a welcome from the Chairman, H.E. Ty Sokhun, and a briefing of the agenda. The main purposes of the meeting were to exchange information on new activities in the sector (presentations) and to discuss the work plan for 2006 and JMI (Joint Monitoring Indicators).

2. Adoption of the Minutes of the Last Meeting

The minutes from the last meeting, held on 28th November 2005, were adopted with few comments. The Chairman suggested that the minutes be shorter in the future.

3. Discussion and Feedback of Comments on TWG-F&E Work/Budget Plan 2006

As the work/budget plan had previously been circulated to partners, the meeting received only two comments, from the Ministry of Environment. The first was a proposal to add one more activity in item # 3.1 that is "3.1.4 Community Protected Areas Development". The second was to add "6.1.2 BPAMP" in the item # 6.1.

The meeting agreed, and the Secretariat revised and edited the work/budget plan (dated 28 Feb, attached).

Mr. Mogens L. Christensen urged donors and private foundations to be accountable and transparent in support to NGOs. He also suggested item #3.1.2 (*Assess and test out "Partnership Forestry" in pilot communes as an alternative form of forest management and a mechanism for forest revenue to contribute to the local development*) be on the agenda for discussion at the next meeting.

Regarding accountability and transparency, Mr. Lay Khim stated UNDP's desire to work and share information with the TWG-F&E Secretariat, in relation to UNDP funding to date, its plans for funding in the near future, and collaboration with TWG-F&E. He will ask relevant project partners and NGOs to indicate their activities to TWG-F&E, such as the estimated budget, programme implementation, etc. By the end of this year all UNDP supported partners and NGOs must be accountable and transparent. It was also stated that UNDP has no intention to fund the "Independent Forest Monitor".

Similarly to UNDP, Mr. Reed Aeschliman, OGD Director, guaranteed, on behalf of USAID, that he will provide all information to the Secretariat on USAID activities with project partners and NGOs. He will provide the Secretariat with copies of the mission reports.

In conclusion, H.E. Ty Sokhun commented that the Secretariat, on behalf of TWG-F&E, should seek information from donors and NGOs on their activities within natural resource management.

4. Discussion on the CG Meeting on 2 – 3 March 2006

In preparation for the CG meeting, it was confirmed that the Mr. Mogens Christensen, H.E. Ty Sokhun, and some of their colleagues, would take up the issue of the debated monitor (Continue Forest and Land Crime Monitoring). It was stated that, in fact, the effect and impact of independent monitoring without an institution to report to is neither an option nor a solution. It was decided to leave the subject on the work plan for potential revision and funding, and progress will be measured according to funding received; and acceptance was received for it to remain as a special temporary JMI pending funding. However, if no funding is received the JMI becomes irrelevant and will be removed. The general principle is that funding must be in place for any JMI to qualify and that JMIs should be realistic and measurable.

H.E. Ty Sokhun said that the issue of independent forest crime monitoring and reporting is a huge challenge, discussed not only with donor communities, but also internally within government. He further noted that the government established a national committee in June 2004 to combat forest land encroachment. Sub-committees had also been established at the municipal/provincial level.

H.E. Ty Sokhun, however, expressed that the main constraint to implementing the above activities is budget. He often received complaints from the field that duties and responsibilities have been allocated, but the resources/funds are very limited. Similarly, he noted that although all stakeholders agreed to the 2005 TWG-F&E work plan, there was no implementation funding.

Mr. Mogens L. Christensen indicated that Danida/Dfid would support the work plan, but only those items that have a clear poverty reducing effect.

H.E. Ty Sokhun concluded that the limited funding to natural resource management is a hot issue that needs to be addressed in the CG meeting and subsequently discussed.

5. Information about JMI (Joint Monitoring Indicators) 2006 for TWG-F&E

Briefly, H.E. Ty Sokhun introduced two main necessary actions. The first is “Develop and Implement National Forest Programme”, and the second is “Strengthening Transparency by Disseminating all Relevant Sector Information on the Activities of Government Agencies, Donors and NGOs by Periodically Posting on TWG-F&E Website”. These issues are not only responsibilities for the government, but for all stakeholders; meaning that accountability and transparency are not only one-sided but include NGOs who need to feed information to the Secretariat. Information sharing by donors and NGOs, to the Secretariat, is at present clearly unsatisfactory and limits the role of the TWG. However, UNDP and USAID willingness to share/work with us on this issue was appreciated.

6. Presentation on the Implication of the New Organic Law on Decentralization and De-concentration for FA and Forestry Sector

Mr. Mogens Christensen informed the meeting that following approval by the Council of Ministers of the Strategic Framework, the Ministry of Interior is in the process of formulating a new Organic Law that will address roles and functions of sub-national administration in Decentralization and De-concentration. “Organic Law” means that this is above other laws. The Organic Law provides the overall legal framework for decentralization and de-concentration to provincial/district/commune councils. The law which is being prepared will result in a uniform administration at the provincial level. A uniform administration means that all officers from line ministries will be accountable to the sub-government administrations.

The meeting endorsed that a Danida consultant who is expected to work with Ministry of Interior and Danida on NRM sector issues would be invited to brief the TWG-F&E and further work with the TWG-F&E Secretariat to ensure that decentralization issues had been properly consulted with NRM department (TWG Fisheries, Forestry and Environment).

At the end of presentation, H.E. Ty Sokhun reported that although he is aware of the preparation of Organic Law, he has never been called for meeting in this regards. However, as also donors supporting this must be accountable and transparent, at a minimum the draft will have to be circulated and disclosed for open debate, comments and evaluation by all relevant stakeholders.

Mr. Lay Khim, from UNDP, requested the Chairman of TWG-F&E to write a letter to the Ministry of Interior to invite the consultants who are writing this Organic Law to join into the process of openness. The Organic Law is controlled by Ministry of Interior.

7. Presentation on the Status of BPAMP (Biodiversity and Protected Areas Management Project)

This presentation was cancelled. Mr. Mogens Christensen urged Mr. Sy Ramony, the representative from Ministry of Environment, to release the report and data on the status of BPAMP. Finally, it was suggested Mr. Sy Ramony to go back to his colleagues and share this issue with them as a priority.

8. Presentation on the Preparation of Annual Bidding Coupe for Domestic Consumption

Mr. Khorn Saret, Chief of FMO/FA, briefed the meeting on the “Preparation of Annual Bidding Coupes for Domestic Consumption”.

FA has planned 4 annual bidding coupes, in Siem Reap, Rattanakiri, Kratie and Stung Treng cantonments. They will be managed through forest inventory & tree marking, environmental and social impact assessments, and preparation of forest management plan; and public bidding procedure. (ref. presentation on the TWG homepage).

Mr. Mogens Christensen questioned how the FA monitors the implementation of bidding coupes by the 4 cantonments. Mr. Khorn Saret explained that even though the monitoring of bidding coupes is not easy, FA has a monitoring procedure. Responding to a question on how FA conducts ESIA, Mr. Khorn Saret continued that firstly, FA has prepared social and economic survey questionnaires for the local communities within and near to the bidding coupe areas. Secondly consultations will be conducted by FA staff through questioning local people to gain feedback for integration into the forest management plan. In conclusion, H.E. Ty Sokhun encouraged all interested stakeholders to visit the coupe that is now operating in Ratanakiri.

Regarding the preparation of the special coupe in Ratanakiri, Mr. Mogens raised concerns regarding how logging could start without a forest harvest management plan. He suggested that FA should specify the on-going activities of coupe bidding, through continually updating FA’s homepage with where the process is up to, what FA is doing, and the time of logging. Further, and in conclusion, Mr. Mogens firmly urged FA to make these procedures, findings, and results of surveys, consultations and evaluation transparent, in order to avoid complaints.

9. Presentation on the New FAO Community Forestry Development Project in North-Western Cambodia (GCP/CMB/026/NZE)

As promised in the last meeting, Ms. Anna Beloff, NRM Officer of FAO, presented this new project. Total funding from NZAID for this minor project is limited to 350,000US\$ for the 2 year period (ref. presentation at the TWG-F&E homepage).

10. Presentation on Capacity Building for Sustainable Forest and Land Management

Dr. Sokh Heng, Acting Chief of CFO/FA informed the meeting that the objective of this project is to help forest dependent communities, FA, NGO partners and local authorities to explore innovative approaches to collaborative forms of participatory forest management. The budget is 2 mill US\$. The project has 3 components:

- Component A – Community Forestry Field Training Component
- Component B – Piloting Community Forestry Partnerships for Implementation
- Component C – Participatory Monitoring, Evaluation and Dissemination

(Ref. presentation at the TWG homepage)

11. OAB

11.1 Presentation on Implementing the Greater Mekong Sub-region Core Environment Programme (ADB Programme)

Mr. Javed Hussain Mir, Senior Natural Resource Specialist from ADB Manila, presented the key elements of the Greater Mekong Sub-region (GMS) Programme. The GMS programme was established in 1992 facilitated by ADB. The Core Environment Programme (CEP), has 5 components, outlined by Mr. Hasan Moinuddin, Biodiversity Conservation Corridors Initiative (BCI) Unit Leader from ADB Bangkok:

1. Environmental assessment of economic sector strategies and corridors
2. Biodiversity conservation and corridor initiative implementation
3. Environmental performance assessments and sustainable development planning
4. Development and institutionalization of environmental management capacity
5. Program development, delivery, and sustainable financing/resource mobilization

BCI pilot sites in Cambodia are in the Cardamom Mountains and in the Eastern Plains. The projects are headed by NGOs; Wild Aid in the Cardamom Mountains and Wildlife Conservation Society in the Eastern Plains.

In alignment with National Work Plans, certain key activities are noted in the TWG-F&E work plan of 2006. Mr. Hasan suggested TWG-F&E checks/corrects the work plan to include the following items:

- Socio-economic value of forest ecosystems protection and biodiversity conservation should be located under BCI
- Benefits to local population from use and managing forest resources via implementation of conservation concepts based on participation could be supported very easily under the BCI component
- Formulate National Community Forestry Programme and develop community forestry and taking it further.

Mr. Eang Savet requested the presenters to correct the figures of Cambodian land area from 181,000 sq km to 181,035 sq km.

In closing, H.E. Ty Sokhun stated that alignment and harmonization from regional to national and local levels are very important, as earlier noted by the TWG.

Mr. Javed Hussain Mir, Senior Natural Resource Specialist from ADB Manila was requested to directly keep the TWG updated with progress via the TWG Secretariat.

11.2 Briefing about the TWG-F&E Homepage

The Secretary announced that the TWG-F&E website is located at <http://www.twgfe.org>. The homepage provides a place of easy access to information within forestry and environmental management and should be kept updated.

12. Close of the Meeting

H.E. Ty Sokhun expressed his sincere appreciation to all members and presenters for their participation, contributions and efforts in the meeting and looks forward to continued contributions and participation in the next forum. He hopes to see the presentation on BPAMP in the next meeting.

The meeting finished at 12:30.

Participants		Secretariat	
1. H.E. Ty Sokhun	TWG-F&E Chairman	1. Mr. Eang Savet	Director, STLFAI, FA
2. Dr. Mogens L. Christensen	Lead Donor Coordinator	Tel: 012-915 372	
3. Mr. Chea Sam Ang	Deputy Head, FA	Email: savet2003@yahoo.com	
4. Mr. Seng Sun Narun	Deputy Chief of PAO, FA	2. MoE Representative. Yet to be nominated	
5. Mr. Khorn Saret	Chief of FMO, FA		
6. Dr. Sokh Heng	Acting Chief of CFO, FA	3. Mr. Arvid Sloth	DANIDA
7. Mr. Sok Srun	CTSP Admin Officer, FA	Tel: 012-969 301	Advisor
8. Mr. Sy Ramony	Chief Office, DNCP, MoE	Email: arvid@online.com.kh	
9. Mr. Hem Van Yuth	Deputy Dept. Director, CDC	arvidsloth@hotmail.com	
10. Ms. Suon Pinkanika	Deputy Officer, MEF	4. Mr. Yuzuru Kimura	JICA
11. Mr. Ho Sivyong	Deputy Chief Officer, MoC	Tel: 012-700 115	Advisor
12. Mr. Sin Sokhon	Deputy Director, MLMUPC	Email: kimura@online.com.kh	
13. Mr. Lay Khim	Team Leader, ARR, UNDP	5. Mr. Men Marina	Secretary, TWG-F&E
14. Mr. Javed Hussain Mir	Sr. N. R. Specialist, ADB	Tel: 012-991 999	Secretariat
15. Mr. Hasan Moinuddin	BCI Unit Leader, ADB	E-mail: twg.fe@citylink.com.kh	
16. Ms. Anna Beloff	NRM Officer, FAO		
17. Mr. Joe Waltson	Director, WCS		
18. Mr. Reed Aeschliman	OGD Director, USAID		
19. Mr. Jean Marc Bouvard	Advisor, MAFF/ French Coo		
20. Ms. Kazumi ITO	Program Assistant, JICA		
21. Mr. Guo Ge	Assistant GM, Everbright		

The minutes of meeting was adopted by the TWG-F&E Meeting on 2006

Recorded by

Men Marina
Secretary
TWG-F&E Secretariat

Endorsed by

Mogens L. Christensen
TWG-F&E Coordinator

Ty Sokhun
TWG-F&E Chairman